MAKING CHEGA! A REALITY

Memory and Memorialization in Timor-Leste
Sites of Conscience Asia Regional Network participants meet with Timor-Leste President José Ramos-Horta

October 2011

Report By Ereshnee Naidu

International Coalition of Sites of Conscience
INTRODUCTION

The International Coalition of Sites of Conscience is a worldwide network of “Sites of Conscience” – historic sites, museums and initiatives that activate the power of places of memory to engage the public with a deeper understanding of the past and inspire action to shape a just future.

A Site of Conscience is a place of memory – such as a historic site, place-based museum, or memorial – that confronts both the history of what happened there and its contemporary implications. Sites of Conscience are places that interpret history; engage in programs that stimulate dialogue on pressing social issues; promote humanitarian and democratic values as a primary function; and share opportunities for public involvement in issues raised at the site.

The Coalition’s goal is to provide every community with a place to confront their pasts, however difficult, and identify how they can act to prevent injustices from recurring. Supporting each other, Sites of Conscience have the opportunity to open the social and political space for dialogue, civic engagement and broader democracy and peacebuilding processes. A significant aspect to realizing this goal is to ensure that members are able to support each other through collaboration and peer exchanges. Regional and thematic networks enable members to build local networks of Sites of Conscience that collaborate to address common contemporary issues. Currently, the Coalition coordinates eight regional and thematic Sites of Conscience networks.

Asian Sites of Conscience Network and Meeting

The Asian Sites of Conscience Network brings together sites remembering both conflict and peace to promote values of ethnic and religious pluralism and democracy, especially among young people. Across Asia, fragile democracies are plagued by waves of violence and instability related to deep-rooted religious and ethnic tensions, which
disrupt democratic processes and open the door for oppressive regimes that could take advantage of growing religious fundamentalism. Asian Sites of Conscience open dialogue on human rights and democracy and inspire the public to become actively engaged in promoting values of democracy and human rights.

At the invitation of the Post-Commission for Reception, Truth and Reconciliation (Post-CAVR), regional coordinator The Liberation War Museum (Bangladesh) in partnership with Post-CAVR held the 6th annual Asia regional meeting at the restored prison site, Comarca Balide, in Dili, Timor-Leste from 30-31 July 2011. The meeting, themed Memory, Truth and Human Rights, brought together delegates from Bangladesh, South Korea, Thailand, Cambodia, Indonesia, Timor-Leste and the United States. The goal of the meeting was to allow each delegate the opportunity to share, assess and develop new methods and approaches to address issues related to their country’s past with the goal of creating opportunities for public dialogue and debate around how the legacy of the past has impacted current social and political realities and how the work of memory can be utilized toward building cultures of human rights, peace, and democracy in each of the country contexts in the region.

Additionally, at the request of Post-CAVR, the international delegation met with various civil society organizations, government officials and political heads (See Appendix One for a full list of meetings) working on issues of transitional justice, human rights, education and memory to share some of their own experiences around the use of memory work as a mechanism to contribute to post-conflict reconstruction and reconciliation as well as to better understand some of the successes and challenges that East Timorese civil society and government face in implementing the recommendations of the CAVR report and Commission for Truth and Friendship (CTF) report.

The following report documents the findings of these meetings. By drawing on the work of the International Coalition of Sites of Conscience in post-conflict contexts and issues that members sites continue to grapple with as they address issues of impunity, justice and reconciliation, the report highlights recommendations for the way forward in Timor-Leste.
BACKGROUND

Timor-Leste – Political Background and Conflict

Timor-Leste, situated in South-East Asia is made up of a population of 1.2 million people. Colonized by Portugal in 1642, Timor-Leste declared its independence from Portugal in 1975 after Portugal, following a military coup in 1974, embarked on a quick and haphazard decolonization process of all of its colonies. The rapid decolonization process led to a struggle for political power which was further exacerbated by Indonesian involvement in Timor-Leste. On 11 August 1975, the Timorese Democratic Union Party (UDT) launched a coup d’état in Dili. The coup led to a civil war in which the Revolutionary Front for an Independent East Timor (FRETILIN) pushed UDT forces into Indonesian West Timor.

Following FRETILIN’s victory, the Indonesian military began random attacks on East Timorese territory. On 28 November 1975, FRETILIN declared Timor-Leste an independent state. On 7 December 1975 Indonesia launched a full scale attack on Timor-Leste, claiming that its actions served to prevent a civil war and the consolidation of power by a perceived communist FRETILIN. Despite the United Nations Security Council calling for a withdrawal of troops, Indonesia illegally occupied (the UN did not recognize the occupation) East Timor from 1975 – 1999. The occupation was characterized by military engagement between the Indonesian and Timorese resistance forces, significant loss of civilian life and widespread and systematic violations of human rights committed principally by the Indonesian military in its bid to break clandestine Timorese civilian support for the guerillas.

Following the resignation of President Suharto in May 1998, his successor President Habibie offered Timor-Leste a referendum on its future. This was held under UN auspices on 30 August 1999 and resulted in a 78% vote for independence from Indonesia. In response Timorese militia supported by the Indonesian military
attempted to demonstrate that most Timorese did not concur with the result and forced
tens of thousands of Timorese across the border into Indonesian West Timor. They also
exacted scorched earth revenge, killed and violated many pro-independence Timorese
and destroyed some 70% of the country’s buildings. At the order of their commander,
Resistance forces were cantoned during this period to avoid outright war with the
Indonesian military. The violence only ceased after an Australian led international force
(Interfet) arrived. The UN administered the country until 20 May 2002, when an elected
FRETILIN-led Government took over and the Resistance leader, Xanana Gusmao,
became President of the new nation.
The Commission for Reception, Truth and Reconciliation (CAVR)

In 2000, a Congress of all resistance parties called for the establishment of a reconciliation mechanism to address past violence and unite the new country. Drawing on lessons from South Africa and Latin America, a representative Committee, supported by the UN, designed the Commission for Reception, Truth and Reconciliation (known as CAVR after its Portuguese title). The CAVR was led by seven Timorese commissioners and functioned 2002-2005 following a period of establishment in 2001. CAVR’s four principal tasks were (a) to establish the truth about human rights violations between 25 April 1974 and 25 October 1999 (especially relating to issues of self-determination, killings, disappearances, forced displacement and famine, torture and detention, economic and social rights; (b) to facilitate community reconciliation for less serious crimes; (c) to restore the dignity of victims; and (d) to report on its work and findings of accountability and to make recommendations that would support the broader objectives of justice and reconciliation.

CAVR’s community reconciliation programme has attracted considerable attention from other post-conflict societies because of its innovative and effective character. The programme focused on less serious crimes and brought together victims, perpetrators and the broader community to work together to find a solution that enabled victims to begin the process of healing and facilitated the reintegration of perpetrators into the community. While the program successfully resolved 1,371 cases, some feel that it compromised the accountability of perpetrators.

CAVR’s report entitled “Chega!” was presented to the President, parliament and government towards the end 2005. The report addresses recommendations to the international community, Indonesia, and the government and citizens of Timor-Leste.

---

1 Chega is a Portuguese word that translates to ‘no more, stop, enough.’ It was chosen as the title for the report as it captures the main messages of victims.
and includes calls for justice, the establishment of a follow-up institution to CAVR and a reparations program targeted to the most vulnerable and the provision of remedial rehabilitation, government and other social services and the memorialization.

**Commission for Truth and Friendship (CTF)**

In addition to the East Timorese domestic CAVR process, in 2005 Indonesia and Timor-Leste established the bi-lateral Commission for Truth and Friendship (CTF). The Commission focused on establishing the truth about the violence that preceded and followed the 1999 referendum and institutional responsibility for these events. However, it attracted considerable criticism in Timor-Leste for offering amnesty (including from the UN) for full disclosure and for its provision that it would clear the names of those wrongfully accused. In practice the Commission did not propose any amnesties, and produced a report entitled Per Memoriam Ad Spem that was generally well received and that found that Indonesian forces were responsible for much of the 1999 violence.

The CTF report makes recommendations for a joint burden-sharing between the Indonesian government and the government of Timor-Leste to undertake a reparations program that includes pensions for former civil servants; the provision of education and health services for victims; the building of a documentation and archives center; and cultural exchange programs that seek to rebuild relations between Indonesians and East Timorese.

In addition to the two commissions, the United Nations set up a special judicial process to investigate serious crimes that were committed during the conflict. Despite the indictment of almost 400 suspects, at the time of writing the report, only 86 convictions have been made while the majority of indictees are in Indonesia and remain free.
FINDINGS FROM ADVOCACY MEETINGS

Role of Memory and Memorialization

In the Coalition's meetings in July 2011 with politicians, government officials, academics, NGO workers and survivors there was general consensus that memory and memorialization initiatives are important to recognize victims of the conflict; acknowledge and recognize the sacrifices made by freedom fighters in the struggle for independence; and contribute towards building a culture of peace and human rights to ensure the non-repetition of previous violations. In a keynote address at the closing ceremony of the regional meeting, the Timor-Leste Secretary of State for Culture, Virgilio Smith, aptly noted that the victory of freedom and independence may be short-lived if the memory of the struggle for freedom is not adequately recognized. He noted that memory was important in inspiring a vision for development, peace and prosperity for current and future generations of East Timorese.

Current Initiatives: Challenges, Successes and Opportunities

Given the broad acknowledgement of the significance of memory and memorialization in fulfilling goals of peace and reconciliation, various government and civil society initiatives are currently being undertaken in Timor-Leste to ensure the non-repetition of the past violations and to recognize heroes and victims of the conflict. Despite many successful endeavors, memory and memorialization initiatives, as in many post-conflict societies such as South Africa, Argentina and Sierra Leone, remain fraught. In Timor-Leste, in addition to contestation by different stakeholders, challenges to these memorialization efforts include questions of coordination, policy implementation, and resources to fund the initiatives in the face of ongoing post-conflict development needs.
The following section outlines selected key initiatives that are being implemented as well as challenges that are faced.

**CAVR and CTF Follow Up**

As noted above, CAVR and CTF both culminated in reports that outlined recommendations aimed toward goals of justice, healing and reconciliation. The CAVR report was presented to Parliament in 2005 and the CTF report in 2008. In 2007, the new Parliament authorized its committee for justice and constitutional affairs to propose concrete steps to implement the recommendations of both reports. The committee developed two draft laws ‘Establishing the Institute of Memory’ and ‘Framework of the National Reparations Program’. However Parliamentary consideration of the two laws has been twice postponed, most recently in February 2011 and at the time of the Coalition’s visit to Timor-Leste, no debate had been scheduled.

Members of civil society noted with concern that the ratification of the two laws was necessary to ensure that there is a way forward on victims’ rights issues. For victims, the ratification of the laws means that government and broader East Timorese society recognizes the violations that they have undergone. For many this is a step towards the restoration of their dignity and a move towards gaining justice for the atrocities that they have experienced.

It is understood that members of Parliament and East Timor’s senior leaders fully support the proposal of an Institute of Memory though there is some debate about the lines of responsibility of the Institute. The functions of the proposed Institute include further documentation, research, statement taking from victims, human rights training and education, and engaging in memorialization and the search for missing persons – all of this in active collaboration with the Timor-Leste government and, where possible, with Indonesia.
However, the reparations program does not enjoy comparable support. Senior politicians have serious reservations about the wisdom and practicality of the proposed program and argue that it will open ‘a Pandora’s box’ and generate conflict. In addition, Veterans and their representatives in the Parliament want implementation of the program delayed until their claims for recognition and compensation are fully addressed. For their part some NGOs believe that the political elite are resisting the proposal for fear that they themselves will be held accountable for human rights violations committed during the protracted conflict.

**Current Memorialization Initiatives**

Like in many post-conflict contexts, the East Timorese landscape is littered with physical reminders of the past. Public and clandestine centers of torture and detention and the devastated shells of buildings throughout the city bear testimony to the devastation, violence and violations that were the almost three-decade long reality for many East Timorese. How can these reminders of a traumatic past be converted into centers of healing and education to ensure that the past is not repeated? How can memories of pain and suffering be transformed into ones of empowerment and visions for a future of peace and prosperity?

**Comarca Balide:**

Post-CAVR is currently based at the ex-Comarca Balide. A former prison notorious for gross human rights violations such as torture and disappearances, the Comarca has since been restored, preserved and converted into a heritage site. The site houses the post-CAVR offices, CAVR archives, library, Chega! exhibition and public meeting spaces. It is also home to the Living Memory Project of the Ex-Political Prisoners Association, a Women’s History Project and the 12 November 1991 Committee.

The Chega! exhibition is open to the public, popular with international visitors to Timor and listed in the Lonely Planet Guide Book as a ‘must-see’. Timor-Leste school and community groups also visit but are fewer in number suggesting the need for alternative strategies appropriate to their circumstances and needs.
I remember ...my father was imprisoned here. He was actually imprisoned in the very same room in which you all are meeting. I remember visiting him every two weeks and my mum bringing him food - Conversation with catering staff at the meeting onsite at Comarca Balide

Everybody, all citizens, irrespective of testimony at the truth commissions or not, have a story to tell. While it is necessary to recognize survivors of sites such as Comarca Balide, such sites have the potential to recognize a broader society by recording the individual experiences and stories of everyday life under repression. In so doing sites like Comarca Balide can work toward developing a collective narrative that can contribute to an imagining of a collective future based on peace and democracy.

Timorese Resistance Archives and Museum: The Timorese Resistance Archives and Museum (AMRT) which opened in Dili in December 2005 is a national project dedicated to the struggle for freedom in Timor-Leste. The museum, located at the site of the old Portuguese courthouse, is in its second phase of building with plans for re-opening in May 2012. The museum space includes a permanent exhibition, archives, coffee shop, auditorium and library.

Veterans Memorials Project: Under the Secretary of State for Veterans, the government is currently in the process of building 65 local monuments that are dedicated to heroes and veterans of the struggle. Thus far over $5 million has been allocated to funding the project. The monuments are replicas of each other and will be rolled out at a local district level.

According to the Secretary of State for Culture, one of the major challenges with regard to memorialization in Timor-Leste is that, given the longevity of the conflict, there are a considerable number of sites across the country that are of historical significance, speaking to issues of human rights violations, resistance, pain and triumph.

Some of these sites exist as shells of buildings, others have been totally destroyed, while yet more have been converted into new business spaces with no acknowledgement of history of torture, triumph or trauma. One of the key questions for government therefore is how best to prioritize sites of significance given the increasing developmental and land needs (especially in the city center). Further, discussions with policy-makers and government officials highlighted that coordination between government departments as well as between national and local levels of government remain challenges. In discussions with Timor-Leste’s President José Ramos-Horta, one
of the key challenges related to memorialization is mediating the country’s broader
development needs with the need to recognize victims and heroes of the conflict.

For members of civil society, a major challenge of government-led initiatives is related
to questions of representation and consultation. It was suggested, for example, that the
national veterans’ project did not adequately engage stakeholders in a broad
consultation process. Furthermore, local NGOs and victims’ groups suggest that the
government’s emphasis on veterans again highlights the marginalization and lack of
justice for victims.

**Revision of History Curriculum**

The government primary and high school curriculum is in the process of revision. The
new curriculum includes human rights education as well as the history of the conflict.
The junior high school curriculum was finished in 2010 with plans to complete the
senior high school curriculum by 2012.

The revised curriculum requires the re-training of teachers. However, given limited
resources, teachers currently undergo only a week-long training which informants have
argued is not adequate. Furthermore, there is a need for teacher-support material and
materials that move the history of conflict from a national level to local level and that
enables learners at a district level to identify with the conflict and the need for peace
and reconciliation on a local level.
RECOMMENDATIONS

It is important to note that as Sites of Conscience work in a variety of contexts, members often face different challenges and opportunities in very different environments. However, the International Coalition of Sites of Conscience provides members with opportunities to share experiences across varying contexts to ensure that best practices can be shared and challenges can be better addressed. It is in keeping with this ethos that the following recommendations are presented.

Ratify Policy for the Establishment of the Institute of Memory and Framework for the National Reparations Program

For many countries seeking to come to terms with the past, the truth commission process is but one step towards the path to reconciliation. The success of the truth commission process lies in its ability to uncover some of the hidden histories, myths and distortions of the past and to facilitate reconciliation and peace. To be effective in the long term this process needs to continue beyond the life of a commission and to build on recommendations made by the commission. The draft laws for the proposed Institute of Memory and a program of Reparations are therefore not optional extras but integral to the on-going process of healing, justice, and reconciliation and should therefore receive priority attention by the Parliament.

The Institute of Memory specifically can play a critical role in coordinating memory initiatives of different government departments and civil society organizations. It could also play an important role in monitoring and evaluating successes and challenges, thereby contributing towards a framework of best practices for reconciliation and peacebuilding efforts in Timor-Leste. The establishment of both the Institute of Memory and the Framework for the National Reparations Program will serve as a tangible marker of government’s will to take forward the recommendations of both of the commissions as well as its will to recognize the suffering of victims.
The current initiatives that have been undertaken toward the reintegration and recognition of veterans, in the absence of processes that contribute towards the healing and justice for victims, has the potential to create a divide between victims, veterans and broader society. For memory and memorialization in Timor-Leste to achieve its potential as a mechanism for reconciliation and healing, memorialization initiatives will require a deliberate, collaborative effort toward developing a collective memory that rebuilds relations at various levels of Timorese society. Such an integrated and inclusive memory process will assist in the recognition and reintegration of both victims and veterans into society as well as recognize the daily experiences of ordinary Timorese under Indonesian occupation. The two policies under review, if ratified, have the potential to facilitate the reintegration and active participation of veterans, victims and ordinary East-Timorese as equal citizens working together in the re-building project of a new Timor-Leste

**Ensure Stakeholder Consultation and International Exchanges**

The success of memorialization initiatives often lies in the process that is undertaken toward developing the initiative rather than the product that is a result of the process. Consultation can be as narrow or as broad as initiators wish to define it; however, a broad consultation process creates ownership and buy-in from all stakeholders.

As the Timor-Leste government embarks on the veterans’ memorialization project, it is important that it considers a consultation process that seeks to include all stakeholders to ensure broad representation and encourage ownership of the project. Additionally, given its national scale, lessons can be learned from countries that have embarked on similar processes. Not only will such consultations and exchanges
ensure that many challenges can be addressed early in the process but they will also provide an exchange of creative and innovative ideas that move memorialization from a static initiative to an active, dynamic and living process.

**Implement Symbolic Reparations that go Beyond Monuments**

President José Ramos-Horta noted that he was in favor of peace park-type projects rather than built static memorials. While built memorials may have a place in the process of recognition and naming, given the urgent development needs in Timor-Leste, development projects such as community centers and public facilities have the potential to serve a broader purpose. Not only can they, through the naming process, serve the function of symbolic reparations and community reparations but these types of projects can also serve to meet critical societal needs through service provision to both victims and the broader community.

**Map the City**

As previously noted, a key challenge that government faces with regards to memorialization is what sites to prioritize for heritage development. An exemplary Site of Conscience member, District Six Museum in South Africa, highlights that simple mapping projects can serve a similar function of recognizing sites of memory that have been destroyed or have to be re-developed for other purposes. Either through digital mapping processes or through artistic mapping processes, sites of memory can be remembered and restored into public memory. Further, the Asia Foundation is...
currently awaiting the Prime Minister’s approval of a proposal for a plaques project. The project seeks to mark various public sites of memory through plaques. A mapping project can serve as an innovative and engaging complementary project to the proposed plaque project.

**Activate the Power of Place**

As noted above, Timor-Leste has numerous sites of memory and history. Sites such as Comarca Balide bear witness to the struggle for freedom in Timor-Leste. While many sites are in various states of disrepair, it is important to note that memorialization does not necessarily require large investments of financial resources. Apart from ensuring preservation and safety at sites, the memory of sites can be activated through creative education and dialogue programs. Through training of staff that can be facilitated by institutions such as the International Coalition of Sites of Conscience, simple dialogue programming that engages the public in ongoing themes around freedom, justice, forgiveness, and reconciliation, can be implemented at memory sites.

---

**Re-making maps, Remaking Memory: District Six Museum, South Africa**

Since the 1950’s South Africa was notorious for its Apartheid policies based on racial discrimination and white privilege. In 1950, the government passed The Group Areas Act, making it illegal for people of different races to live together. In Cape Town, this was justification for the complete destruction of the neighborhood called District Six. Founded in 1867, District Six was the gateway to Cape Town. Originally a community of freed slaves (brought by the Dutch from Southeast Asia), it was also home to merchants, artisans, laborers, and immigrants. Over the decades it remained a working class neighborhood characterized by a rich mix of cultures and a vibrant artistic and intellectual life. Despite its prime location, District Six had been allowed to physically deteriorate and became a target for redevelopment. In 1966, it was declared a “whites only” area.

People didn’t believe they that would be forcefully removed from the place that they always knew as home. However, by 1981, the destruction was complete.

By 1982, the life of District Six was over. In defiance, the former residents waged fierce battles against redevelopment. The District Six Museum was a powerful force behind the eventual victory that reclaimed the land for the dispossessed. The people of District Six realized memory was the only weapon they had, but they needed an organized way to remember and a place in which to do it. The District Six Museum filled both needs.

As a part of its commitment to community ownership and participation, one of the first projects that the museum embarked upon was a mapping project. Visitors to the museum and community members were invited to recreate a map of the place that was District Six. Based on their own individual and collective memories, this simple recreation of place stimulated an outpouring of memories; allowing the dispossessed residents of a once vibrant community to literally rewrite themselves back into the center of the city. Today the floor map in the center of the Methodist Church building, bears testimony to the pain, struggles, celebrations and triumphs of District Six.
Such programs can facilitate ongoing public engagement, making sites living, organic spaces, contributing to the ongoing needs of East Timorese as well as to larger goals of building a culture of human rights and peace in Timor-Leste.

Further, these sites can complement the revised history curriculum by serving as inexpensive resources to teach learners about the past. While it was noted during the meetings that there are often no financial resources for educational support materials for these sites, let alone resources to travel to the sites, it was also noted in various meetings that there is no shortage of memory sites in all regions of

Through the dedication of volunteers, many of whom are veterans, the mobile museum is able to overcome challenges of human and financial resources while pursuing its mission to engage young people in dialogue around peace, tolerance and human rights in Bangladesh.

Timor-Leste. Sites of memory and their significance should not be restricted to national sites or urban-based sites. By engaging learners in oral history projects and inter-generational dialogue, sites of memory can be identified at a district level and through dialogue programming, be used to support the revised history curriculum.
REFERENCES

Background Documents


## APPENDIX

List of Individual Meetings in Alphabetical Order

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Institution/Department</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Jacinta Barreto</td>
<td>UNESCO volunteer and coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fernanda Borges</td>
<td>Member of Parliament: Chair of Committee A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kirsty Sword Gusmão</td>
<td>Chair UNESCO Commission, Ambassador at Large for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>José Ramos- Horta</td>
<td>President of Republic of Timor-Leste</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armando Maia</td>
<td>University of Timor-Leste</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuno Rodriques</td>
<td>Women's History Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maria da Silva</td>
<td>Living Memory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virgilio Simith</td>
<td>Secretary of State for Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mara Bernades</td>
<td>Museum of Resistance and Archives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Members of 12 November Committee</td>
<td>12 November Committee</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>